

THE REMNANT OF ISRAEL

An Analysis of G.G. Rupert
and His Independent
Church of God (Seventh Day) Movement,
1915-1929

by

Richard C. Nickels

August 15, 1972

Revised, 1993

Important Ideas

“The facts are there is not a single text in the New Testament that teaches that any law that God ever gave was abolished and nailed to the cross” Only the sacrifices and oblations have ceased, as stated in **Daniel 9:27** (G.G. Rupert, 1915).

“There is . . . a true church. . . . Its appointed seasons of worship are all appointed. The ministry with all other gifts needed in its government and service is all provided for. The mind that guides this organization and service is divine. . . . It is called the ‘Church of God.’ . . . Man cannot add one single member to the church. God does that” (G. G. Rupert, 1919).

“Does the thing follow that because man organized a church and called it the CHURCH OF GOD, that it is the church of God? Not at all” (G.G. Rupert, 1921).

“Sunday . . . Easter, Christmas, Good Friday, Ash Wednesday, and various days . . . are all of heathen origin and belong to Babylon, the mother of harlots. The majority of teachers know this, but for various reasons they will still try to keep the people in ignorance and support the old system of Babylon” (G.G. Rupert, 1921).

Summary

G. G. Rupert, for many years a Seventh-Day Adventist minister, became an independent Church of God (Seventh Day) leader from 1915 to 1922. His work continued past his death until at least 1929. His teachings about prophetic Israel and observance of the Holy Days were remarkably similar to the teachings of Herbert W. Armstrong from 1931 to 1986. Rupert had a strong influence on the development of the twentieth Century Church of God (Seventh Day).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
History and Purpose of <i>Remnant of Israel</i>	183
Life of G.G. Rupert.....	183
Observer of the Holy Days.....	185
An Independent.....	185
Independent View of Church Organization.....	186
Doctrine and Teachings.....	186
Holy Days Observed.....	187
Meaning of Feast Days.....	188
Sabbath Teaching.....	189
Books and Tracts.....	189
Seven Church Eras.....	190
Other Rupert Beliefs.....	191
The Prophetic “Yellow Peril”.....	191
Widespread Ministry.....	192
Pasadena Conference.....	192
Rupert’s Associates.....	193
Remnants of the Remnant Party.....	193
Sultz’s “United States in Prophecy”.....	194
Parallels Between G.G. Rupert and H.W. Armstrong.....	195
Differences Between Armstrong and Rupert.....	196
Lessons From Rupert.....	197
FOOTNOTES.....	198
Selected Copies of <i>Remnant of Israel</i>	201

G.G. Rupert's *Remnant of Israel*

Is there a true organization?" This was the title of the lead article of *The Remnant of Israel* of April, 1919.

"To the above we certainly say yes," the article began. "There is also a true church. As to this organization and church, man has had nothing whatever to do in shaping it in any way . . . All man has ever had to do with it was to accept it as it was made by the Lord himself. This church is perfectly organized even to detail governing the actions of all its members. Its appointed seasons of worship are all appointed. The ministry with all other gifts needed in its government and service is all provided for. The mind that guides this organization and service is divine. It needs no constitution, or by-laws, that are not given in the Bible. It has no committees to nominate its officers or plan for its finances. The same laws that governed Adam and Eve govern each member today. It has but one head and that is, Christ . . . It is called the 'Church of God.' . . . Man cannot add one single member to the church. God does that." And as for its ministers, the article concluded, God chooses them.¹

History and Purpose of *Remnant of Israel*

The *Remnant of Israel* began in April of 1915. It was published by the Union Publishing Company, first at Britton, Oklahoma, later at nearby Oklahoma City. The managing editor and founder was G.G. Rupert.

Its purpose was clearly stated in the original issue: "There is no paper in print which meets the present demands of God's word, to now give the people the whole truth . . ."

The paper's purpose was to teach "many doctrines of the Bible heretofore entirely neglected, or if taught at all, . . . taught unscripturally . . ." Some of these neglected doctrines were: (1) the *identity of the true Israel* of the Bible, (2) *prophecies of the yellow races* (including Russia) to overrun and devastate America, (3) that the *law of Moses was NOT nailed to the cross*, which others were falsely teaching, and (4) that ancient *Bible prophecies* referring to such peoples as Ephraim, Judah, and Assyria have never been fulfilled and will be fulfilled in the twentieth century.²

Life of G.G. Rupert

Born in Ohio on May 12, 1847, G.G. Rupert lived to the age of 74 and died on July 17, 1922. Originally a Methodist, Rupert served as a Seventh-Day Adventist minister for thirty years, including several years as a missionary in South America. He was president of the Oklahoma Seventh-Day Adventist Conference (covering five states, including Oklahoma) at the time he left the Adventists. He must have left them at or before 1902, because he stated in 1905 that from 1902 to 1904, he had been connected with no denomination.

G.G. Rupert preached all over the United States. Nearly blind for 28 years, he miraculously regained sight of one eye ten years before his death. His wife died in 1921.³ His only son, H.W. Rupert, was born in 1871 and died in 1925.⁴

Seventh-Day Adventist leader Ellen G. White died in 1915, the same year the *Remnant* began. Rupert had known her personally for nearly forty years and for many years believed in her visions. When he later compared them with the Bible, Rupert rejected Seventh-Day Adventism. Still he eulogized her as a "sincere, honest servant of God," whose life

¹*Remnant of Israel* (April 1919). Unless otherwise noted, all citations are from the *Remnant*.

was commendable to all Christians.⁵ What finally led to the open break with the Adventists was Rupert's publishing books contrary to the Seventh-Day Adventist teaching. He had friction with the Adventists for three to five years before he left them.⁶

Disagreement between Rupert and Seventh-Day Adventists was reported in the *Remnant* of November 1915. Adventist Elder J.H. Morrison at College View, Nebraska, wrote a booklet titled "A Straight Talk to Old Brethren," which denounced the teachings of Elders Jones and Rupert. Rupert retorted, "I hold that William Miller and all Seventh-Day Adventists were led in false and unscriptural teaching on prophecy."⁷

Rupert's most famous book was *The Yellow Peril*, a 530-page work on prophecy, which sold for \$2.25 in 1911. (It is available from Giving & Sharing.) The third edition is dated 1918. The book was advertised in the *Bible Advocate* (published by the Church of God, Seventh Day) of May 27, 1913, and the ad was possibly the earliest mention of Rupert in that source. *Yellow Peril* was also advertised in the *Bible Advocate* of November 9, 1915.

In scattered issues of the *Advocate*, which are still available, there are several articles written by Rupert. For the issues of May 27 and June 3, 1913, he wrote a series on "The Book of the Law." The issues of June 10 and 17, and July 8 and 15 of the same year all contain articles by Rupert, showing that the laws of God are not "done away." On page 506 of the *Bible Advocate* of June 17, 1913, is Rupert's unique chart on the "Laws of God," later reproduced in his own *Remnant of Israel* of February 1916.⁸

Observer of the Holy Days

On Rupert's "Laws of God" chart are the Ten Commandments, statutes, dietary laws, the Holy Days. Passover, Feast of Unleavened Bread, Firstfruits (Pentecost), Trumpets, Atonement, and Feast of Tabernacles, along with Jubilee or the fiftieth year. Rupert not only held to the name "Church of God" but also taught observance of the Sabbath and all the Bible's laws and Holy Days.

An Independent

G.G. Rupert was one of the independent Church of God (Seventh Day) leaders, who for reasons of doctrine, refused to go along with the Stanberry headquarters. In the early 1900s the Church of God was split between the "regulars" and the "independents." G.G. Rupert was one of the leading figures among the independents. Along with the *Bible Advocate*, Rupert made mention of five other papers, all having some truth, all teaching the Ten Commandments, including the observance of the Sabbath (and all, possibly, published by Church of God independents):

*The Evangel of Hope*Joplin, Missouri
*The Gathering Call*Riverside, California
*The Shining Light*Almira, New York
*The Mispah*Enid, Oklahoma
*Religious Liberty*Washington, D.C.

The reason for so many papers, Rupert says, was desire for religious liberty, which the older organizations had not granted.⁹

Rupert's articles in the *Advocate* are by no means surprising. At that time, the *Advocate* carried articles by people of many divergent views and regularly stated that the views expressed therein were not necessarily representative of the doctrines or teachings of the General Conference of the Church of God. But Rupert was not an "ordinary" writer. His articles in the *Advocate* on the Holy Days are amazing. A.N. Dugger, the editor, allowed these articles to be printed, if indeed he had the power of control. Stanberry never accepted the Holy Days, but was given a convincing presentation of them in 1913 by G.G. Rupert.

Rupert advertised the *Bible Advocate* at least twice, in the *Remnant* issues of May and November 1915. But apparently his disagreement with Stanberry grew stronger because later he ceased advertising the *Advocate* and instead wrote against Stanberry's form of church organization.

Independent View of Church Organization

Remnant supporters "do not believe the

Bible teaches the present system [Stanberry Church of God] of church organization. We hold that the true church of the Firstborn of whom Christ is the manager of each individual but not by man. Neither is it visible, but that church is made up of the true children of God whose names are written in heaven. Their faith is whatever the Bible teaches.”¹⁰ The independents believed that “the Church of God of the Bible was, is, and always will be, only nondenominational. Its organization is spiritual and divine, not human.”¹¹

I.C. Sultz, Remnant editor, explained why he had refused to join the Church of God Conference: It was an organization of men, and therefore of necessity had to have a creed, which fixed limits as to the meaning of certain points in the Bible. “Development” — understanding new Bible truths — was impossible because “the organization never changes its positions on any subject.”¹² Stanberry was inflexible, and refused to accept new truth, especially that regarding God’s law and Holy Days and the identity of modern Israel. These were the reasons Sultz gave for being a member of the independent Remnant group.

In reply to an Advocate article of February 1, 1921, which denounced those who opposed organization as spreading the divisive work of Satan, Rupert stated that Christ is the only head of His Church. He asked, “does the thing follow that because man organized a church and called it the CHURCH OF GOD, that it is the church of God? Not at all”

Dugger’s organization was called “the Church of God,” but the name did not make it so. Its organization was not the Bible organization. “It is a fraud and imitation.” Rupert was against the electing of church officers and the appointing of ministers who had of themselves chosen the ministry. Rupert admitted that he did not know what was the proper method of organization, but hoped he would soon learn.¹³

Doctrine and Teachings

The convincing truth that Rupert taught was astounding. *Remnant of Israel* articles,

preserved in the New York Public Library, are fascinating to read; they are simple and clear and are studded with numerous relevant Bible texts. Here are some of Rupert’s teachings, as recorded in the *Remnant*:

Church Name

“There is but one true church of God;” all other churches were said to be in Babylon.¹⁴ In addition to the name “Church of God,” the title “church of the Firstborn” (**Hebrews 12:23**) was emphasized.¹⁵

Bible the Authority

The Remnant stood for “the teaching of the whole Bible in one harmonious unbroken line from the first verse in Genesis to the last verse in Revelation.”¹⁶

Mortality

Rupert and his followers rejected the doctrine of the immortality of the soul. They taught that man is mortal¹⁷ and that the time of probation (deciding for eternal life or death) was almost over.¹⁸

Laws of God

Remnant articles boldly declared that the laws of God in the Old Testament had not been abolished: “The facts are there is not a single text in the New Testament that teaches that any law that God ever gave was abolished and nailed to the cross”¹⁹ Only the sacrifices and oblations have ceased, as stated in **Daniel 9:27**.²⁰

Pagan Holidays

Other articles denounced holidays observed by most professing Christians. “Sunday . . . Easter, Christmas, Good Friday, Ash Wednesday, and various days . . . are all of heathen origin and belong to Babylon, the mother of harlots. The majority of teachers know this, but for various reasons they will still try to keep the people in ignorance and support the

old system of Babylon.” Even worse are true Sabbath-keepers who say the law of Moses is abolished, contrary to **Malachi 4:4**,²¹.

Holy Days Observed

Rupert taught that the laws of God in the Old Testament, including the Holy Days, were still in effect. Paul “scrupulously . . . observed the Jewish feasts” as stated in **Acts 18:21**. The New Testament does not replace the old.²² With such beliefs, G.G. Rupert and his followers probably kept every one of the Holy Days. Following are lists of festivals and dates observed, as recorded in the Remnant of Israel:

1920²³1926²⁴1929²⁵

Passover April 4 April 30
[April 2]*[Mar. 29]

Pentecost May 26 June 18
[May 24][May 24]

Trumpets Sept. 18 Oct. 6 Oct. 2
[Sept. 13][Sept. 9][Oct. 5]

Atonement Sept. 28 Oct. 15 Oct. 11
[Sept. 22][Sept. 18][Oct. 14]

Tabernacles Oct. 3-10 Oct. 19 Oct. 16-23
[Sept. 27-Oct. 4][Sept. 23-30][Oct. 19-26]

* Dates in brackets are those calculated by Ambassador College, Pasadena, California, through the courtesy of John Kossey.

There was some controversy over the keeping of Passover. The *Remnant* of June 1919 states that Passover should be taken at the beginning of the 14th of the first Jewish month, Nisan.²⁶ In the 1928-29 papers, some supported the 14th; others, the 15th.²⁷ Mrs. W. Moore wrote that Jesus kept the Passover and that Christians are also to keep it on the evening of the 14th.²⁸

Pentecost was reportedly calculated from the weekly Sabbath during the Days of Unleavened Bread.²⁹ But the dates in the Remnant were on various days of the week, indicating that at one time Rupert held to a Sivan 6 Pentecost calculation. The *Remnant* of

September 21, 1921, however, states that Pentecost was always on a Sunday. Rupert apparently did not use the Hebrew calendar. He explained some of his calendar views in *The Theocracy of Israel*, pages 290-291.

Meaning of Feast Days

The meaning of the fall Holy Days was clearly expressed by John S. Stanford in the Remnant of Israel of September 1929. The following paragraphs summarize his views:

The “Memorial of Blowing of Trumpets,” is a command for us to observe a “Memorial-Day Sabbath,” as commanded in **Leviticus 23:24-26**. The physical blowing of trumpets has ceased, but we are to continue keeping this memorial. God is a faithful notifier, as **Amos 3:7** testifies. He will give notice of Christ’s Second Appearing, and this Holy Day reminds us to look up these notifications in His Word.³⁰

“Atonement” means “At-One-Ment” or “at one mind.” We are born with a carnal mind. We are to have our minds renewed, as **Romans 12:2** states, by taking on the mind of Christ, **Philippians 2:5**. Christ’s death was the first step in the Atonement. The second step, our part, is to accept His sacrifice as the Atonement for our sins. And the third step is to keep up a life of obedience, which we can only do with Christ’s help, not by ourselves. This new life of obeying God and overcoming temptations is a continuous process until “final salvation.” We are reconciled by Christ’s death, but saved by His life, as **Romans 5:10** declares. It is impossible to earn salvation by our own works,

only by Christ's life in us will we be saved. Atonement is a memorial, "by keeping which we may remember what He has done for us." To afflict the soul (life) means to fast (go without food and water). Since Christ was afflicted for us, we afflict ourselves on this day in recognition of what He did for us.³¹ Atonement is the antitype of a future event at the close of probation.

The "Feast of Ingathering" is a type of the resurrection of the just after the close of probation. The Feast of Tabernacles, another name for this feast, is a type of the future time when the remnant will again dwell in tabernacles for forty years. The Feast of the Jubilee is a type of the new earth. "These feasts all from the Passover forward are consecutive in their order, leaving the ones mentioned still future."³² That is, the Holy Days reveal the plan of God in dealing with mankind.

One Remnant group in Battle Creek, Michigan, in 1926 was keeping all the Feast Days. Those members cited were Adolph Schenk and F.L. Van Sloten.³³ Although observation of the "new moons" is not included in Rupert's chart of the Laws of God, a "new moon" (first day of the month on the Jewish calendar) on the Wednesday before Thanksgiving, 1927 [or 1926?] is mentioned in connection with this same group in Battle Creek.³⁴

Sabbath Teaching

The Sabbath was taught and observed by the Remnant people. But unlike Seventh-Day Adventists, and especially Seventh Day Baptists, Rupert and his followers did not discuss the Sabbath incessantly. In their view, discussing overmuch the Sabbath-Sunday controversy was useless. The best way to handle the Sabbath question was to "show the people there was no change when Christ was here in any way in the whole law written in 'The Book of the Law' . . . They will soon give up the case."³⁵

Books and Tracts

G.G. Rupert published his first book in

1902. The following list of his books and articles has been gleaned from issues of the Remnant.³⁶ Many of these books and articles are available as reprints. Write us for details.

- The Yellow Peril (530 pages)
 - The Inspired History of the Nations (3 volumes, 750 pages)
 - Time, Tradition and Truth
 - The Bible Atlas
 - The Inspired Biblical Ecclesiastical and Secular History of the World (by G.G. Rupert, 6 volumes, 2500 pages)
 - "The Two Covenants, the Old and the New, Between God and Man" (65 pages)
 - "The Four Great Cycles" (36 pages)
 - "Peace or War"
 - "The Call of the Ministry and Their Support"
 - "The Two Women of the 12th and 17th Chapters of Revelation"
 - "The Story of the Jew and the Remnant of Judah"
 - "Consecutive Events in Their Order Following the Close of Probation"
 - "The Book of the Law Found Again"
 - "The Gift of Tongues Examined"
 - "A Positive Appeal and Challenge to Seventh-Day Adventists and Others To Cease Teaching Error"
 - "Is There a True Church Organization?"
- Articles written by others include:
- "The Bible Church of God" (40 pages by Lloyd Shanklin)
 - "Coming Events Cast Their Shadows" (by Adolph Schenk)

Seven Church Eras

Rupert's ideas on true church history were similar to those of the Stanberry Church of God. The Stanberry group thought that *they* were the Laodicean era, while Seventh-Day Adventists held that *Adventists* were Laodiceans.³⁷ Rupert believed the "ten days" of "tribulation" (**Revelation 2:10**) were the ten years of persecution by Diocletian, 302-312 A.D., during the Smyrna era. Thyatira, he stated, lasted from 538-1798 [1260 years, exactly as Stanberry calculates it]. In the

Yellow Peril, Rupert stated that the Sardis era lasted from 1798-1833, while the Philadelphia era lasted only from 1833-1844. Rupert admitted his dates were not clear breaks, for it is “clear to our mind that more than one of the last churches live co-temporary and at the same time.” This is a key truth, he stated, and shows that the church in the last days needs to be alert and ready for the return of the Messiah. And of his own group, “Like all other of the churches it is the works that determine our standing before God.”³⁸ Elsewhere, Rupert hinted that the Stanberry Church of God was the dead Sardis era of the true church.

Other Rupert Beliefs

The following are additional beliefs held by Rupert and his associates:³⁹

Tithing is commanded.⁴⁰ Christmas is pagan and should not be observed by Christians.⁴¹ Divine healing should be entreated by laying on of hands and prayer or handkerchief, as practiced by Rupert associate Lloyd Shanklin.⁴² Speaking in tongues is in languages that can be understood.

Rupert was against Christians participating in warfare. “I prefer to lose my life than ‘killing someone’ under a fit of enthusiasm or imaginary loyalty” he declared. He would kill no one unless directly commanded by God.⁴³

John S. Stanford, a Remnant editor, wrote that it is wrong for a Christian to vote.⁴⁴

Despite letters published in the Remnant seeking to enlighten him (for example, Dr. T.E. Reed), Rupert persisted in believing that Christ was crucified on Friday and rose on Sunday. He maintained that the “heart of the earth” was not the grave.⁴⁵ Rupert’s belief was identical with the Adventist point of view, but his belief was at variance with the Church of God teaching of a Wednesday crucifixion and Saturday resurrection.

On the top of every issue of the Remnant was a flag symbol labeled “The Ensign of Israel” with 12 stars, and stripes with words of scarlet, yellow, blue, and purple (since the printing was in black and white). This symbol represented the “Sign of the Son of Man,” which Rupert believed to be the rainbow.⁴⁶

The Prophetic “Yellow Peril”

This writer has read only a small portion of Rupert’s voluminous works on prophecy. As cited before, Rupert believed the yellow races (including Russia) would eventually invade and devastate America. In October, 1917 he predicted that the Japanese would eventually menace the United States.⁴⁷ Britain was said to be Tyus.⁴⁸ The King of the North (Turkey) would join the King of the South (England) against Russia.⁴⁹ Ephraim was said to be Protestantism.⁵⁰

G.G. Rupert’s prophecies of a “Yellow Peril” (title of his famous book) were somewhat prophetic in predicting the coming menace of Japan even while the Japanese were United States allies during World War I. From a modern global perspective, it is easy to see how Japan could indeed lead the hordes of the East in an assault against the West.

Widespread Ministry

The scattered issues of the *Remnant* which are still available do not give a complete picture of Rupert’s work.

Rupert lived for eight years at Choctaw, Oklahoma, where he raised up a church of twenty members. He also lived for a time at Liberal, Kansas where he raised up another church of over twenty.⁵¹ At Hartland, Kansas, he raised up a church, baptized six and ordained Elder I.C. Sultz in 1916. Sultz had become a convert of Rupert’s about twenty-five years before.⁵² Although Rupert met much opposition to his teachings at Omega, Oklahoma, he baptized five at Britton; he also worked at Dale and McCloud, Oklahoma in 1916-17.

In February of 1917, Rupert held debates in Oklahoma City with a Russelite minister, C.P. Whitaker. Three to five hundred people attended the debates, which mainly concerned the laws of God.⁵³

In the summer of 1918, Rupert visited Sultz at the latter’s home in Maybell, Colorado. Afterwards Rupert spoke at Denver; Lincoln, Nebraska; Dodge Center, Minnesota; Battle Creek, Michigan; and Cleveland, Ohio.⁵⁴ At College View, Nebraska, he held meetings

at the home of B. Dresselhaus. At Battle Creek, home of the Adventists, he held lectures for ten days at the home of Brother Hummel before twenty-five listeners.⁵⁵ On this trip Rupert also visited Vanwert, Ohio, where he and his wife had begun observing the Sabbath. Rupert had been baptized nearby in 1876 in his hometown of Mendon, Ohio.⁵⁶

Pasadena Conference

In the spring of 1919, Rupert met other Sabbath-keepers from all over the United States at a meeting in Pasadena, California. He stayed at the home of Sister Drury and was assisted in the meetings by Elder Leland.⁵⁷ The Pasadena meetings continued for twenty-seven days.

At Pasadena, the following seemingly prophetic statement was made:

“The day is not far distant when the work will go in power to every child of God in the world and call the honest to the truth for this time God has been performing a great work. It now at last looks like the time was now here for the execution of the work So now is the time to teach a whole truth to the Remnant.”⁵⁸

Rupert held seventy consecutive meetings while in California, nineteen of which were at a black Free Seventh-Day Adventist church in Los Angeles. The Adventists there became a part of Rupert’s movement and secured Elder J. Watson of Washington, D.C., as their pastor.⁵⁹

Rupert’s Associates

Some of those associated with Rupert were: Elder Adolph Schenk of Battle Creek, a contributing editor after December 1921, who was mentioned previously as an observer of all the Holy Days; Elder I.C. Sultz of Maybell, Colorado, who was ordained by Rupert in 1916, and became a contributing editor beginning in December of 1917; Sister C.P. Drury of Pasadena; Elder Black of Michigan; Elder A.P. Ballenger, whom Rupert had known since the 1880’s, and who had preached at the Los Angeles meeting but died soon afterwards

(1921); and Elder Alonzo T. Jones, who preached with Rupert at College View and Lincoln, Nebraska, in 1914, and died in 1923.⁶⁰

From the start of the *Remnant*, C.M. Hayhurst was an early contributing editor with Rupert. However, Hayhurst’s name is unaccountably absent from the March 1917 and subsequent issues. The *Remnant* had failed to issue from June of 1916 until February of 1917, but the paper was revived by a group of nine persons, each pledging twelve dollars to renew publication.

John S. Stanford was a later contributing editor, who wrote a series of articles on the Holy Days in 1929. He was probably the one who continued the work after Rupert’s death in 1922.

The most prominent associate of Rupert was Evangelist Lloyd Shanklin of Cedar Rapids. Shanklin emphasized divine healing at his protracted revival “gospel tent” meetings. He held a successful campaign at El Dorado Springs, Missouri, in 1923, where he bought a forty-by-sixty-foot tent for \$350. It appears that in 1923 Shanklin abandoned his opposition to the Stanberry organization, and united with them.⁶¹ The Stanberry Church of God paid for the seats for the tent services. It is reported that he healed 5,000 in Kansas City, 100 in Moberly, Missouri, and 3,000 in Topeka. His meetings were “interdenominational” and probably rife with showmanship. At Oklahoma City in December 1927, his tent burned to the ground at a loss of \$3,000.

Remnants of the Remnant Party

G.G. Rupert died on July 17, 1922. His daughter, Lucille Rupert Smith, took over as managing editor of the paper. From that time, the *Remnant* was frequently filled with old reprint articles. The last issue in the New York Public Library is dated November 1929.

After Rupert’s death, Stanford apparently took real leadership of the movement, along with Sultz. What happened to the paper after November 1929 is not known. There is no indication that either of the two men affiliated with the Stanberry group. Neither Stanford nor Sultz are mentioned in the *Advocate* of that

time. Shanklin, however, left the independent group and joined with Stanberry because he felt the work could be better done through the Stanberry Church of God.

Others of the independent Church of God united with Stanberry. Yet independent ideas which had been sown in the early 1900's remained for some time, and, due to the inflexibility of Stanberry, resulted in internal dissension over doctrine that led to the split of 1933..

A church in Knox, Indiana, known as the "Church of the Firstborn," united with Stanberry in 1924 under the leadership of Elders C.E. Groshans and George W. Sarber. The church had been founded by Elder Willis Logan and had organized in 1889. Its members reportedly kept the annual day of Pentecost, and may have kept other Feast Days.⁶² This group may have been a remnant of Rupert's influence.

Sultz's "United States in Prophecy"⁶³

I.C. Sultz, who married Rupert's daughter, lived into the late 1960's. His book, *The Tragic Story of Gentile Israel*, is (according to Elder Frank Walker, a "British Israelite" believer connected with the Seventh Day Church of God of Meridian, Idaho) a condensation of *The Yellow Peril* (written by G.G. Rupert in 1901 in Liberal, Kansas). In modern terms, "Yellow Peril" refers to the "Russian Menace."

In his book, Sultz states that the book of Hosea deals exclusively with "Gentile Israel" which he defines as having three divisions: Judah (Greek Catholic); Israel (Roman Catholic); and Ephraim (Protestantism). Since the United States is the home of Protestantism, Sultz concludes that the United States is Ephraim in prophecy. (This idea has been adopted by some members of the Seventh Day Church of God.) Thus, the "Gentile" United States will fulfill prophecies referring to Ephraim.

Sultz quoted **Isaiah 7:8**, "In sixty-five years, Ephraim will be broken that he be not a people," and stated that this prophecy began to be fulfilled in 1918, and would end with Ephraim's destruction in 1983. World War III

would start in 1980 and last for three years. The World Council of Churches would unite Catholics and Protestants and then the Russians would crush them in a great battle finally culminating at Armageddon. The ten kings would be headed by a German Communist and would devour Roman Catholicism (also denoted as Moab).

Sultz's basing his conclusions upon assumed analogies and identifying nations in prophecy with little or no proof is, unfortunately, a common trait among Bible teachers. The utter failures of such prophetic interpretations should teach us to be careful. We should wait until the Eternal makes prophecy known rather than spreading our own personal conclusions.

I.C. Sultz remained for years an independent Sabbath-keeper. The message in **Jeremiah 31:6-7**, of the "watchman on mount Ephraim" was a warning message to the United States, as the modern "Ephraim," Sultz believed, and "has been presented to the world as I understand for a number of years by Mr. [Herbert W.] Armstrong." Yet Sultz inferred that Armstrong himself might be part of the Babylon that he warned would be destroyed.

In 1969, Sultz died. Two years earlier, in 1967, Sultz had appointed William J. Walker of Opportunity, Washington as director of *The Remnant of Israel*. Assistant Director, and chief financial supporter, was Earl Russell of Spirit Lake, Iowa. W.J. Walker, like Rupert, was a former Seventh-Day Adventist. His views, expressed in his book, *Remnant Message to Modern Israel*, are much more virulently racial than Rupert's. Walker's Israel Identity beliefs hold that it is impossible for Jews and Negroes to accept Christ. I do not believe that Walker was very familiar with Rupert, nor do Walker's ideas have much resemblance to Rupert's teachings.

Parallels Between G.G. Rupert and H.W. Armstrong

Remnant of Israel teachings were in many ways strikingly similar to those advanced some twenty years later by Herbert W. Armstrong, an ordained minister of the Church of God in Oregon who later broke with the Seventh Day

Church of God to form his own Worldwide Church of God. Armstrong's beliefs were as much at variance with Church of God (Seventh Day) teachings as the beliefs of G.G. Rupert.

Here are some similarities between the teachings of the *Remnant of Israel* and the *Plain Truth* (magazine founded by Herbert W. Armstrong in 1934):

(1) Both Rupert and Armstrong believed, taught, and practiced observance of all the Feast Days of the Bible, while the Church of God (Seventh Day) observed only the Passover (Lord's Supper).

(2) Both were at variance with Stanberry over the issue of the true Israel of the Bible, and both taught that many prophecies referring to Ephraim, Judah and Assyria were yet to be fulfilled. The United States in prophecy was a focal point of both men's prophetic teachings.

The Church of God (Seventh Day) has, since the days of the Adventist movement, taught that the Jews constitute all of Israel, and that they must return to Palestine before Christ returns. The church views the return of the Jews to their national homeland since 1914 as the fulfilling of prophecies of a "Second Exodus" of Israel, while Armstrong and Rupert maintained that these prophecies have not been fulfilled because all Israelites are NOT Jews.

(3) Both Armstrong and Rupert were against election of church officers and self-appointed ministers. Meanwhile, Stanberry continued to practice church elections.

(4) Pasadena, California figured prominently in the work of both Rupert and Armstrong.

(5) Rupert and Armstrong both held that the Church of God (Seventh Day), headquartered at Stanberry, Missouri, was the "Sardis era" of the Church, while Stanberry believed itself to be the "Laodicean era."

It is quite likely that Herbert W. Armstrong was familiar with the teachings of G.G. Rupert during the 1920's and 1930's when Armstrong was formulating his own beliefs. Certainly, Church of God (Seventh Day) leader Andrew N. Dugger, a close associate of Armstrong during the early years, was a student of Rupert. Dugger, while writing in his 1920's book *A History of the True Religion*, referred to the

1860's Church of God paper as the *Remnant of Israel* when the name of the paper was actually *Hope of Israel*. Dugger was such an avid reader of Rupert that he confused the name of the 1860's Church of God paper with Rupert's contemporary paper! If Armstrong himself was not acquainted with Rupert, he must certainly have learned of Rupert's teachings through his early association with Dugger.

In summary, the movements led by G.G. Rupert and Herbert W. Armstrong held remarkably parallel beliefs. "Holy Day" and "British Israel" teachings of the Church of God (Seventh Day) did not originate with Herbert W. Armstrong in the 1930s. Such ideas had been presented to (and rejected by the majority of) Church of God leaders in the early 1900's through G.G. Rupert and his Remnant of Israel. Indeed, there was only a "remnant" in the Church of God who held these minority views.

Differences Between Armstrong and Rupert

It should be noted that there are differences between Armstrong and Rupert. About 1950, Armstrong abandoned his belief in local autonomy and established a strong, centralized church government, with himself as the head. Rupert never varied from his independent view of church government and never established a permanent church organization as Armstrong did.

Rupert's prophetic beliefs were very different from those of Armstrong. Armstrong believed Anglo-Saxon America and the British Commonwealth were *racially* descended from Israel, while Rupert believed they were "Gentile Israel," Gentiles who would fulfill prophecies, such as Hosea's, which relate to Israel. For Rupert, the big threat to modern Israel was the *Orient*, that is, the Japanese, Chinese and Russians. For Armstrong, it was a *United Europe* led by the *Germans*.

Rupert never lived into the age of radio and television. His media were mainly books and articles. He was a far more prolific and scholarly writer than Armstrong, who generally wrote short religious articles.

Mrs. Otis Cole (mother of Raymond Cole and a member of Herbert Armstrong's church from the early 1930's) says that the Coles did not know of G.G. Rupert until the late 1940s, after they had moved to Oregon from Fairview, Oklahoma. Her statement is surprising and indicates that Rupert's audience did not include many in the Church of God, Seventh Day.

Lessons From Rupert

It has been claimed that copies of Rupert's paper, Remnant of Israel, were found in later years in Herbert Armstrong's basement in Pasadena, California. This assertion does not prove that Armstrong acquired many of his beliefs from Rupert. Even if Armstrong had done so, this fact would not validate or invalidate these doctrines. It is regrettable that some who are against the truth of God use a supposed Rupert-Armstrong doctrinal tie to "prove" the doctrines are erroneous. Actually, discovering someone prior to Armstrong who held similar views lends credence to the doctrines. There is nothing new under the sun.

When the veil of history is totally lifted by the Almighty, we will probably all be surprised to learn exactly how the Eternal preserved His truth through scattered individuals throughout the ages, many of whom were unaware of the existence of others. When Elijah thought he was the only one serving God, the Eternal informed him that there were 7,000 men who had not bowed the knee to Baal. Even today there must be a "Remnant of Israel" who follow the Almighty and compose His "little flock," **I Kings 19:18, Romans 11:4-5.Ω**

FOOTNOTES

¹⁰III (September 1919), 4.

¹¹IV (April 1921), 8.

¹²IV (May 1921), 1.

¹³Ibid., 10-12.

¹⁴II (May 1917), 4-5.

¹⁵VI (August 1923), 3-4.

¹⁶II (May 1917), 4-5.

¹⁷I (April 1915), 5, article by C.M Hayhurst.

¹⁸I (April 1915), 5-6, article by Marie Gunnerson.

¹⁹I (June 1915), 7.

²⁰IV (April 1921), 8.

²¹I (August 1915), 1-3.

²²I (June 1915), 6-7.

²³IV (October-November 1920), 3-4.

²⁴VIII (September 1926), 5.

²⁵X (September 1929), 1-2.

²⁶III (June 1919), 1.

²⁷X (March 1928); X (November 1928), 5; X (January, 1929), 5-6.

²⁸Ibid.

²⁹IV (September 1921), 1.

³⁰X (September 1929), 1-2.

³¹Ibid., 2-4.

³²II (May 1917), 4-5.

³³IX (December 1927), 7.

³⁴Ibid.

³⁵ II (April-May 1916), 4.

³⁶I (April 1915), 4,8; IV (June 1921); VI (May 1923), 2.

³⁷*Bible Advocate*, LXII (August 11, 1908), 387.

³⁸IV (January 1920), 1-3, 5-7.

³⁹I (June 1915), 1

⁴⁰I (October 1915), 1.

⁴¹VIII (November 1926), 6-7.

⁴²X (September 1928), 3.

⁴³II (May 1917), 7.

⁴⁴X (September 1928), 5-7.

⁴⁵III (September 1919), 5-6.

⁴⁶II (October 1917), 8.

⁴⁷Ibid., 5-6.

⁴⁸V (May 1922), 2.

⁴⁹*Yellow Peril*, cited in *Remnant*, I (April 1915), 6.

⁵⁰I (June 1915), 4.

⁵¹I (March 1916), 4.

⁵²II (March 1917), 4-5.

⁵³Ibid.

⁵⁴III (September 1918), 4.

⁵⁵III (October 1918), 4.

⁵⁶III (November 1918), 4-5.

⁵⁷III (June 1919), 4-5.

²I (April 1915), 4.

³V (July-August 1922), 1.

⁴VII (July 1925), 1.

⁵I (August 1915), page 3.

⁶II (July 1917), 4.

⁷I (November 1915), 5.

⁸*Bible Advocate*, XLVII (June 17, 1913), 506; *Remnant*. I (February 1916), 2.

⁹II (June 1917), 8.

⁵⁸III (July 1919), 4.

⁵⁹III (April 1919), 8.

⁶⁰IV (August, 1920); IV (October-November 1920), 8; I (March 1916), 4; V (November 1921), 4; V (July-August 1922), 2.

⁶¹X (September 1928), 3; IV (April 1921), 8; VI (January 1923), 4; VI (March 1923), 4; VII (October 1925), 4; IX (December 1927), 6.

⁶²*Bible Advocate*, LVII (1923), 77; *Harvest Field Messenger*, IV (June 20, 1924), 2.

⁶³I.C. Sulz, *The Tragic Story of Gentile Israel* (Kinsley, Kansas: 1966).